

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Basic Information

Contact Name and Details	Barbara Bircumshaw (revdbirc@btinternet.com)
Status of Paper	Interim
Action Required	To decide Resolution/s
Resolution/s	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Conference receives the Report. 2. The Conference authorises the Music Resources Group, in consultation with the Methodist Council and the Faith and Order Committee, to continue its work, preparing a new authorised baseline collection of hymns and songs for Methodist worship in succession to <i>Hymns & Psalms</i> and to present a full list of contents for approval to the Conference of 2010. 3. The Conference adopts the criteria used to determine the inclusion and exclusion of items from the new collection set out in Appendix A. 4. The Conference authorises the Music Resources Group in consultation with the Methodist Council and the Faith and Order Committee to prepare a rolling resource and/or regularly updated online resources of received material, bringing proposals to the Methodist Council for an appropriate timetable in the light of other Conference decisions above.

Summary of Content

Subject and Aims	This Report lays out the arguments for continuing work on a new authorised baseline collection of hymns and songs for Methodist worship It takes into account the range of options requested via public consultation and memorials to Conference.
Main Points	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ∞ Introduction ∞ Work of the Music Resources Group ∞ Consultation on draft list ∞ Consultation with Faith and Order ∞ Rolling resource and web page ∞ Production and costing ∞ Membership ∞ Appendix A – criteria for selection ∞ Appendix B – MRG response to consultation on list ∞ Appendix C – analysis of the Consultation ∞ Appendix D - revised contents schema ∞ Appendix E – overview of costings ∞ Appendix F – timeline for contents and production ∞ Appendix G list of the current members of MRG

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

<p>Background Context and Relevant Documents (with function)</p>	<p>The new hymn collection has been commissioned by Conference:</p> <p>2003 – direction to mph to consult with others and bring proposal for a supplement</p> <p>2004 – <i>Proposed Hymnbook supplement (Agenda item 64)</i> authorised mph to seek to develop the capability to make available in one or more electronic forms a rolling collection of recommended hymns and songs, and to explore whether or not such supplementary material should also be published in book form</p> <p>2007 – <i>Singing the Faith: Resources for Worship (Agenda item 48)</i> authorised the preparation of a new ‘baseline’ collection of authorised hymns and songs for Methodist worship in succession to <i>Hymns & Psalms</i>:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ∞ MRG to evaluate material ∞ Full list of hymns and songs by Sept 2008 ∞ Consultation about proposed content by March 2009 ∞ Collection to be published in 2010 <p>It also authorised a ‘rolling resource to be published electronically, and a constantly update collection of topical and contemporary material to be made available on the website’.</p> <p>It directed mph to bring costings for implementation to Conference 2008.</p> <p>2008 – <i>New Resources for Singing the Faith: interim progress report</i>. In light of mph issues this requested to bring costings to Conference 2009.</p> <p>Several memorials have been received, some of them questioning the need for a new collection. M2, M3, M4 (2008) and M42, M43 and M44 (2009) are relevant.</p>
<p>Consultations</p>	<p>Joint meetings of MRG/mph task group/Connexional Team staff Faith and Order Committee Strategy and Resources Committee Methodist Council Andrew Moore Public consultation via website and <i>Methodist Recorder</i></p>
<p>Risk</p>	<p>Risks concerning specific formats for publication are stated in the report or its appendices.</p> <p>Risks of continuing the work include: further investment of time and money prior to final Conference decision; reputational risk if a list cannot be ultimately agreed; large investment with uncertain income; financial hardship in Local Churches.</p> <p>Risks of not continuing the work include: the lack of an up to date authorised hymn collection for use in Methodist Churches, a resource available in different formats, wastage of time and money so far; reputational risk if project is dropped as impossible.</p>

1. Introduction

- 1.1. The Conference of 2007 directed the Music Resources Group (MRG) to prepare a new 'baseline' collection of authorised hymns and songs for Methodist worship in succession to *Hymns & Psalms*. This replaced a decision made at the 2004 Conference which authorised **mph** to fund the work of the Music Resources Group to prepare a resource supplementary to *Hymns & Psalms* together with a rolling resource of recently written material. The draft list for the new baseline collection was to be made available in the autumn of 2008 so that there could be consultation in the Connexion prior to the list being presented to the Conference of 2009. The new collection was to be published in 2010.

The Conference also approved the preparation of a 'rolling resource' of commended material additional to the new collection to be published in 2011 and annually thereafter.

The Conference further approved the preparation of a constantly updated collection of topical and contemporary material to be received and made available on an appropriate website.

- 1.2. The Conference directed that the MRG should work in consultation with **mph** in its work of evaluating material for the new collection. **mph** was directed to bring detailed cost

proposals to the Conference of 2008 for the implementation of the recommendations adopted by Conference. The **mph** Conference Report of 2008 requested that the costing information be brought to the Conference in 2009 and costings related to a baseline collection and to the alternative of producing a supplement to *Hymns & Psalms* are included with this Report at Appendix E.

- 1.3. The Conference approved an enlarged membership of the MRG to reflect a diversity of age, gender, theological outlook and experience of a variety of worshipping styles and musical traditions. This has included members of the Youth Conference, the Faith and Order Committee, preachers, worship leaders, musicians and authors.
- 1.4. Following the Conference of 2007 the MRG ceased to be funded by **mph** and has been resourced by the Connexional Team. Administrative support has been provided from within the membership of the MRG.

2. The Work of the Music Resources Group

- 2.1. The MRG is working purposefully and energetically to produce a successor to *Hymns & Psalms* to represent the breadth of Methodist worship and the devotional usage of hymns within Methodism. The collection will also express distinctive Methodist theological emphases.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

2.2 At an early stage the MRG considered whether the new collection should be ecumenical. Some initial enquiries were made but MRG received little response. Many of the major denominations have either produced new collections in recent years or taken policy decisions not to produce such a collection. The Church of England does not sponsor any particular hymnbook as a denominational standard and hymnody does not hold the same fundamental place in it as it does in Methodism. This is also the case with other denominations. It was thus decided that, given the importance of hymnody within Methodism it made sense to produce a collection which is specifically Methodist. Throughout the compilation process we have kept in mind our relationships with ecumenical partners. As a consequence it is intended that the collection will be eminently suitable for use in ecumenical settings and local ecumenical partnerships.

2.3 The MRG has met approximately one day a month supplemented by four residential sessions. The Group has reviewed over a hundred collections published since *Hymns & Psalms*, including individual and international material and numerous texts have been sung. Among the more difficult issues tackled are the following:

- ∞ the arrangement of material in the collection balancing the needs of congregations, preachers and worship leaders whilst reflecting Methodist

- doctrine;
- ∞ providing a balance of existing material and new hymns and songs;
- ∞ ensuring a balance between traditional style hymnody whether old or modern and worship songs;
- ∞ the need to ensure that material is approachable by church musicians of varying skill and experience; and
- ∞ the sensitive task of establishing criteria in relation to gender and language, particularly when editing older texts.

[See Appendix A]

2.4 The MRG has made presentations and provided workshops on a number of occasions including the Heart of Worship Conference in 2007, the Methodist Music Society Conference in 2007 and 2008, the Youth Conference 2008, the Wesley Study Centre's Open Summer School in 2008 and at a number of Synods in 2008/09. DVDs were produced for Conference (2008) synods and Breakout. Articles have also been written for *Momentum*, *Ichthus*, *Methodist Evangelicals Together* and the *Methodist Recorder*. These have enabled lively debate which has raised challenges and enthusiasm for the project.

2.5 There are two sub groups as well as the main committee, a Words Group and a Music Group. The members of the Words Group have worked

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

on the placement of hymns and songs within the contents schema and on editing texts. The Music group is concerned with musical arrangements and tunes. The music in *Hymns & Psalms* is being reviewed as well as arrangements for new items. The Music subgroup has been grateful to receive the expertise of Paul Leddington-Wright and David Peacock who have worked with them to edit and rewrite tunes on a modest fee basis. Together, the sub-groups intend to produce footnotes giving suggestions for the use of material in worship.

3. Consultation of draft list November 2008- January 2009

- 3.1 A draft list of hymns and songs was published on the Methodist Church website and in the *Methodist Recorder*. It contained seven hundred items but it is intended that the final collection will have around eight hundred items, comparable with *Hymns & Psalms*. Space was left in order to respond effectively to comments received through the consultation process and the MRG was aware of gaps in particular sections which need to be addressed. A considerable number of responses were received and these have been evaluated by the Revd Brian Hoare.
- 3.2 Brian Hoare undertook an analysis of comments made during the consultation process and identified a number of issues that the MRG

has addressed, and will continue to address. Upwards of 600 responses were received both through the website and in written form, and although there was criticism as well as support, the quantity and breadth of interest was encouraging. It was reported verbally by Brian Hoare that in the light of the responses received the MRG was perceived as moving broadly in the right direction.

The following issues were highlighted:

- ∞ affirmation of the need for a new collection
- ∞ whether a new resource should be a complete collection or a supplement to *Hymns & Psalms*
- ∞ the overall balance of writers in the collection, including John and Charles Wesley and others, both traditional and contemporary
- ∞ the balance of themes in the collection, especially in those areas where MRG had already identified weaknesses e.g. in the life and ministry of Jesus and in material for all-age worship
- ∞ the place of psalmody in the collection
- ∞ the formats (book and electronic) and user-friendliness of the collection
- ∞ the inclusion of too much unpublished/untested/unknown material .

- 3.3 Whilst MRG has received support for the proposed new collection, some people have also expressed the view that a new collection is unnecessary because there is so

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

much material already available, and that connexional and local church resources should be employed elsewhere in a difficult economic climate. Some have suggested that the Conference should revert to the original proposal for a supplement.

- 3.4 MRG believes that a new collection can provide the Methodist Church in the twenty-first century with a new resource for the worship of God that celebrates our Methodist heritage and contains the best of contemporary hymnody. *Hymns & Psalms* will be nearly thirty years old by the expected publication date and since 1983 there has been a vast increase in the material written to be sung in worship. Many non-denominational collections used in our churches enrich worship but tend towards a theological perspective not reflective of the breadth of Methodism. They do not contain the breadth or emphases of denominational collections and are often limited in the range of contemporary authors and genres they represent.

It could be argued that a supplement would address these issues; that it could be used alongside *Hymns & Psalms*; and that a supplement would be cheaper to purchase. However *mph* has led us to believe that a supplement is commercially questionable and the work of MRG prior to 2007 also demonstrated that this was not the best solution, a perspective which was confirmed

by the Conference in that year. The current draft of new material for the collection includes five hundred hymns and songs not in *Hymns & Psalms* which would make a large supplement and probably have to be pruned. Such an addition is deemed necessary to give representation to the plethora of material which has been produced since the publication of *Hymns & Psalms*.

There are those who advocate that the new resource, whether a main collection or a supplement, should only be produced electronically. However instrumentalists and singers need a printed music edition and preachers and worship leaders need a reference resource. The MRG further believes there is a tradition of using Methodist hymnbooks for private devotion and study which we should reclaim. In addition there are those who through visual impairment or for other reasons need to have a printed copy. Moreover many churches choose for a variety of reasons not to use projectors. On account of these factors it is felt there is still a need for printed resources as well as electronic.

[See Appendices B and C]

4. Consultation with the Faith and Order Committee

- 4.1 At the same time as the consultation, the draft list was submitted to the Faith and Order Committee. The Committee raised several concerns

particularly in relation to the contents schema and the authorisation of texts and asked that time be made available for detailed scrutiny of the texts and the complete collection in collated draft form. Following that consultation, a revised contents schema was prepared and is included in the appendices.

[See Appendix D]

The MRG and the Faith and Order Committee are continuing to work closely together to complete the process. The Faith and Order Committee have set aside dedicated time in the autumn to review a draft of the new baseline collection, and specific time within its regular round of meetings for follow-up work where this is needed.

- 4.2. In particular, the Faith and Order Committee have sought to clarify the issue of authorisation. In 2008, Conference agreed the 'Statement on the Status of Liturgical Texts'. This statement made it clear that an authorised text is one *"which has undergone the scrutiny of the whole church, through the Methodist Conference and its Faith and Order Committee, and are thus authorised by the Conference as the normative texts of the Methodist Church in Britain. Such liturgies include those published by the Methodist Church in the Methodist Worship Book (2000), and in its predecessors and successors. These texts express the corporate doctrinal/liturgical mind*

of the Conference." This statement matches the scrutiny processes for the present baseline collection, *Hymns & Psalms*, the text for which was presented to the Faith and Order Committee for an extensive period of scrutiny. It is clear that if a new baseline collection were to operate as an authorised text within the Methodist Church, then it would have to be scrutinised by the full Faith and Order Committee on behalf of the Conference so that the Committee's recommendations could inform the mind of the Conference. It is also clear that the baseline collection must express the corporate doctrinal and liturgical mind of the Conference. Since the Conference is itself a historic body, such authorisation must also include reference to the Deed of Union and our other classic foundation documents – it must stand alongside its predecessors as an authentic expression of Methodist theology and identity. This criterion is somewhat different from ensuring that the collection does not fall foul of a particular Methodist doctrinal emphasis. Moreover, the scrutiny process relates both to the complete collection and also to specific texts within the collection – not that specific texts must represent the corporate doctrinal and liturgical mind of Conference, but that each text contributes appropriately to the whole collection. As such, apart from texts drawn from the *Methodist Hymn Book*, each hymn text for inclusion in *Hymns & Psalms* was considered by the Faith and Order Committee. This

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

precedent needs to be followed in the present context. This will require the Faith and Order Committee to commit considerable time to scrutinise the draft text and make recommendations to the Conference of 2010, with the probability of incurring costs for printing and for holding a special residential meeting of the Committee to consider the document.

4.3 The resolutions of the 2007 report on the new hymn resource included the phrase ‘in succession to *Hymns & Psalms*’. It is clear that there is some confusion about the meaning of this phrase, specifically to the ongoing status of *Hymns & Psalms* if the Conference authorises a new baseline collection. Methodism does not de-authorise classic texts. As such, *Hymns & Psalms* will remain as an authorised collection of Methodist hymnody, just as the *Methodist Hymn Book* also remains an authorised collection. Whilst it may be that the new collection will seek to replace *Hymns & Psalms* as the hymn resource ‘of choice’ around the Connexion, it will not replace *Hymns & Psalms* in the sense of de-authorising the older text.

4.4 A memorial raises the possibility that Conference may wish to consider reverting to the previous Conference decisions that the MRG be asked to compile a supplement to *Hymns & Psalms* rather than a replacement for that text. It is clear that a supplement would not carry

the same level of authorisation as a new baseline collection. Again, the ‘Statement on the Status of Liturgical Texts’ offers a secondary level of authorisation which is suitable for this kind of document. A supplement could be regarded as a *Commended* text. Such texts will *have been commended for use by the Faith and Order Committee of the Methodist Church, usually after they have undergone the scrutiny of the Worship and Liturgy Resources Group*. Such texts do not normally receive the scrutiny of the whole Faith and Order Committee, nor indeed of the Methodist Council or the Methodist Conference. It is clear that while such texts can have a broader remit to explore theological issues and contemporary expression which, although not being in conflict with the doctrinal standards of the Methodist Church, they do not necessarily carry the corporate doctrinal/liturgical mind of the Conference. This status is particularly useful for significant but necessarily ephemeral texts and contexts, although such considerations would be covered by the ‘rolling resource’ (see paragraph 4.5). Any decision to regard the baseline collection as a supplement to *Hymns & Psalms* would remove the requirement for an extensive scrutiny process by the whole of the Faith and Order Committee, but would still require significant scrutiny work by elements of that Committee.

4.5 The proposal for a rolling resource of hymn resources matches the final

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

category of texts in the Statement – namely received texts: *texts which have their origins in a variety of places and which have been reviewed by the Worship and Liturgy Resources Group as a whole, or members of it on behalf of the group. The report of such a review may be reported to the full Faith and Order Committee, but the committee is unlikely to have engaged in the review itself. Such liturgies are those published by the Connexional Team or from external sources and offered for use on the Connexional Website for Special Sundays. Any material that is placed on the developed liturgical resources page of the Connexional website falls into this category.* Such texts can be collated and agreed by members of the Worship and Liturgy Resource Group of the Faith and Order Committee. With this in mind, two members of MRG were invited to join the Worship and Liturgy Resource Group so that they could act as the collators/receivers of the rolling resource, reporting on their work to the Resource Group and through them to the Faith and Order Committee and to the Methodist Conference.

4.6 Finally, the point of the proposed scrutiny process is to ensure that the normative texts of the Church carry the doctrinal standards, emphases, tradition, values and ethos of the Methodist Church into the worship expression of a new generation of Methodists. In such a process, the sometimes competing concerns of tradition and innovation, ancient and

modern, understanding and mystery must always be held in careful and particular tension.

4.7 In response to issues raised by the Faith and Order Committee, MRG has sought to describe its task as follows:

- ∞ to provide a rich Methodist collection of hymns and songs for Christian worship which:
- ∞ expresses the core beliefs of the Christian faith as set out in the major creeds;
- ∞ reflects Methodist emphases, particularly Arminianism, assurance, perfect love, social holiness (expressed in contemporary and in historic texts);
- ∞ takes account of the cultural significance of a range of musical styles with an understanding that the appeal of the collection will depend in large part on the actual experience of singing the hymns and songs contained therein;
- ∞ contains nothing contrary to our Methodist doctrinal standards (Clause 4 Deed of Union).

4.8 In the light of work which remains to be completed, arising from the ongoing work of MRG, the public consultation and the consultation with Faith and Order, the MRG now recommends that an additional year is required and that the new collection be brought to the 2010 Conference for authorisation, and for publication in 2011.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

5. The rolling resource and the webpage

- 5.1 The rolling resource is intended to provide a means of supplementing the core collection with contemporary hymns and songs, some of which may be of a more ephemeral nature. As MRG has primarily focussed its energies on the new collection, this has not been discussed in depth. As material has been reviewed the scoring information has been recorded and further material has been received and held on file. This will be of considerable assistance in defining the first rolling resource. In any event, the very nature of a rolling resource means that it cannot be prepared too far in advance of its publication.
- 5.2 *mph* advised that, for commercial reasons, the first edition of the rolling resource should not be produced the same year as the new collection but the following year. The MRG therefore recommends that the publication of the rolling resource should now be deferred until 2012. Further discussion will be needed on the contents of the resource, the method of determining the contents and the formats of publication.
- 5.3 Following the 2007 Conference the MRG set up a web page which is accessed through the Methodist Church site. New material is posted on the site applicable to the liturgical seasons of the year and in response to particular situations and is proving to be a valuable resource.

6. Production and costing

- 6.1 The MRG expected to work with *mph* to produce the new collection but the decisions of the 2008 Conference have changed the situation. *mph* will no longer exist as a separate entity by the time of the 2009 Conference and its continuing functions are being integrated with and managed by the Connexional Team under the authority of the Methodist Council.
- 6.2 Members of the MRG, the Chair of *mph*, and Janet Morley (Manager of the Christian Communication, Evangelism and Advocacy Cluster in the Connexional Team) together with the Secretary of the Faith and Order Committee have met to coordinate the various strands concerning the publication. Options and costings are being canvassed for producing the material in different formats.
- 6.3 A significant issue has been identified in producing an electronic resource particularly in relation to copyright. Whilst many publishers provide electronic media to accompany worship resources and sometimes as the main resource, the MRG is aware that some copyright holders who are willing to allow print production, are currently withholding permission for electronic versions of their copyright material. Thus a solely electronic version of the collection would omit some material which would be available as a printed resource. In order to enable the widest range of material to be

available at the outset a printed collection is preferred. This does not preclude the preparation of as much material in electronic form as is possible and this could be updated if copyright restrictions are eased.

- 6.4 It should be noted that online resources are subject to the same potential copyright problems as other electronic resources but that, in addition, there are costs incurred in administrating such a resource in terms of collecting and paying royalties. The site might need to charge users a licence fee annually and distribute royalties proportionately to copyright holders. In addition it is assumed that a copyright licence return will be made for each item used locally. For our proposed material this would require not only a CCL Licence which many have, but also a Calamus licence which Methodists usually do not have.

[See Appendices E and F]

7. Membership

- 7.1 As agreed by the 2008 Conference, the MRG has welcomed a representative from the Irish Conference, the Revd John Alderdice.
- 7.2 Steve Pearce has resigned his membership because of his new post as Asia Secretary in the Connexional Team. Originally he was appointed

to the Group as Connexional Children's Secretary and the MRG has expressed its gratitude for his contribution since the Group was established. It has also expressed thanks to Sally Thornton who is no longer able participate as a group member.

[See Appendices G]

8. Conclusions

- 8.1 The MRG has worked very hard to comply with the Conference deadline of 2009 and members are disappointed not to fulfil that commitment. There is however considerable enthusiasm and commitment to complete the task. It is our view that this collection will further the Methodist Priority: **'To proclaim and affirm its conviction of God's love in Christ, for us and for all the world; and will renew confidence in God's presence and action in the world and the Church'** particularly as it will continue to enable the Church to underpin **'everything we do with God-centred worship and prayer'**

The MRG will work with the Faith and Order Committee and the Connexional Team to ensure that a collection of excellent quality is submitted to the Conference for authorisation in 2010 and publication the following year.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

For the resolutions adopted, see the section headed “Resolutions” after the Appendices and the Procedural Report 35A (entitled “Responding to memorials about the proposed new hymn collection”)

APPENDIX A

Criteria for hymn texts for the proposed Methodist Collection

Criteria for continued inclusion:

- 1.1 Texts which are historically significant in terms of their representation of Methodist tradition, heritage or theology or broader Christian usage and tradition.
- 1.2 Texts which fit the criteria 3.2, 3.3, 3.4 for new texts.
- 1.3 Texts in widespread use across the Connexion.
- 1.4 Texts in more limited but significant use in parts of the Connexion.

Criteria for exclusion:

- 2.1 Texts which are rarely if ever used. Use to be determined partly by preliminary surveys carried out by **mph** (circa 2004) and by the combined knowledge and experience of members of the Music Resource Group (MRG) but with due attention given to the historic importance and contribution to Methodist identity (see 1.1).
- 2.2 Texts which are archaic in language or metaphor, but with due regard to 1.1.

Examples:

- ∞ *Hymns & Psalms* 340, ‘There is a book (who runs may read)’ – the use of ‘runs’ today is not what it was when this text was written and neither is the original intent of the author in the use of the word clear. Later in the same text the word ‘descry’, (meaning, to catch sight of), is used which has fallen into disuse.
 - ∞ It is intended to retain *Hymns & Psalms* 338 with the omission of verse 5 which speaks of ‘the sprightly man, or warlike horse...all are too mean delights for him’: while Biblical, this phrase does not have the same metaphorical force it once had.
 - ∞ Military imagery, when associated with conquest, crusade or colonialism has been avoided: ‘With the cross of Jesus going on before’, ‘Life and salvation his empire shall bring’.
- 2.3 Texts which are gender exclusive (in relation to humanity) where this exclusivity cannot be effectively edited and the text is not of historic significance.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Amendment of older texts:

- 2.4 Where it can be sensitively done in relation to the context and style of the hymn, to remove gender exclusive language with reference to people.
- 2.5 Where modifications are thought to be necessary, texts should be used that have already been modified in ways considered to be successful in other collections such as Church Hymnary 4 and which are available on HymnQuest. This would serve to make ecumenical singing easier and save us re-inventing the wheel.
- 2.6 To consider in relation to individual items the possibility of removing “thee” and “thou” (where the usage is not rhyme dependant and where such change does not damage the overall quality of the hymn by mixing contemporary and archaic language).
- 2.7 Where an author has produced a definitive version of a text which is still in copyright this must be used or the text excluded.

Criteria used to decide on the acceptance of new texts for the proposed Methodist Collection

- 3.1 Texts to be considered should have become available since 1980, the date of preparation for publication of *Hymns & Psalms (H&P)*, unless a special case is made for inclusion (see 3.5), on the grounds that the text may have been overlooked, or have remained popular despite its exclusion from H&P
- 3.2 New texts should be gender inclusive in relation to people and offer a balance of gender language in relation to God.
- 3.3 New texts should be in contemporary English using appropriate language, theological reference and metaphor. (See 1.2) e.g., ‘Rejoice! Rejoice! Christ is in you’ which contains the lines, ‘Now is the time for us to march upon the land/into our hands he will give the ground we claim’ would not be included.
- 3.4 Following the Methodist Worship Book texts have been sought which include a range of imagery about God e.g. mother, shepherd and rock; as well as traditional expressions such as Father.
- 3.5 Texts which are widely or popularly used will be considered on merit even if they breach the notes 3.1 and 3.3; e.g., ‘How great thou art’.
- 3.6 Texts which are contrary to Methodist theology or doctrinal standards will be

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

excluded, the final court for decision being the Conference after consideration of the advice of the Faith and Order Committee.

- 3.7 Within these constraints texts have been sought which express the fundamentals of the Christian faith in new and fresh ways or which address contemporary issues.
- 3.8 Contents suggested by the MRG members.
- 3.9 Hymns printed in the Methodist Worship Book should be included with unaltered wording.

APPENDIX B

MRG response to the consultation on the proposed new hymn collection

The Music Resources Group is very grateful to the number of people who responded to the consultation on the proposed hymn collection. The responses were collated by staff at Methodist Church House and then evaluated by the Revd Brian Hoare. This was a considerable task as there were several hundred responses received through the website and in written form. It was encouraging to receive such interest, but hardly surprising as hymns and songs are so important a part of our Methodist tradition.

The Music Resources Group met with Brian Hoare to receive his Report and talk through his findings. There was broad support for a new collection and the MRG was seen to be moving in the right direction. There were those who wondered whether there should be a complete collection or a supplement to *Hymns & Psalms* and a few argued that a new resource is unnecessary with so much material already available in other collections used in churches across the Connexion.

Some responses highlighted the need to improve the overall balance of the collection in terms of writers and themes. As this is to be an authorised Methodist collection people felt strongly there should be an adequate representation of hymns by Charles Wesley as well as other historic texts, including John Wesley's hymns and translations, and also a good balance of contemporary writers working in a variety of styles. Attention was drawn to weaknesses in the balance of themes, for example, in the Life and Ministry of Jesus and All Age Worship and the MRG is already aware of these shortcomings. There was concern about the place and use of psalmody, musical arrangements, the formats of the collection and whether the collection should be produced in printed and electronic form. People also felt that many hymns and songs were new to them and they could not access them easily.

Since receiving Brian Hoare's Report, the MRG has revisited *Hymns & Psalms* and gone through all the hymns again and made some additions, in particular in relation to hymns

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

written and translated by John and Charles Wesley. The most requested hymn was 'In the bleak mid-winter', which was voted the most popular Christmas Carol after we had left it out! It's now back on our included list. We have also looked at modern material recommended to us and included further items. The Contents List has been revised in collaboration with the Faith and Order Committee and hymns and songs have been grouped under different sections and themes. This will enable us to look at the overall balance of the collection in respect of writers and themes, taking note of the concerns raised in correspondence received. The Music Sub-Group is continuing to work on musical arrangements and has received expert help from Paul Ledington Wright and David Peacock.

We are determined to create a resource which will be user-friendly for worship leaders, musicians and congregations alike, and that will be available in different formats. Members of the Connexional Team have taken this on board and have been working on issues concerning the production and cost of the resource.

The MRG has sought to adhere to the timescale agreed by the Methodist Conference but the issues raised by the public consultation and our consultations with Faith and Order and the Connexional Team have made it clear that in order to produce a collection of the highest possible quality, an extra year will be required to complete the process, and we will therefore be recommending to this year's Conference that the draft collection is brought to the 2010 Conference ahead of publication in 2011. We believe that this will give time to produce an excellent collection for use in Methodist Churches in the twenty first century and also give opportunities for people to get a preview of the new material in 2009/2010. Members of the MRG will be pleased to respond to invitations to lead workshops for churches and Circuits and to attend Synods.

APPENDIX C

MRG Consultation Survey: Executive Summary

1. Data Collected

1.1 As part of the consultation process for the development of the new hymn book resource, a survey was issued asking four questions:

- Q1. What do you think about the balance of the collection? Is there a good mix of traditional hymns, worship songs, world church songs etc.
- Q2. Are there any authors/song writers who do not appear on the list whose work should be considered? Please list them.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Q3. Are there other themes or subjects you would like to see included? Please list them.

Q4. Please let us have your comments/suggestions about the collection.

- 1.2 This survey appeared on the Methodist Church website (24/11/08-01/02/09) and was published in the *Methodist Recorder* (27/11/08), alongside the proposed list of hymns for inclusion in the resource. The advertised cut-off date for responses was 31 January. In this period, there were 5,972 unique page views of the 'Sing a New Song' webpage.
- 1.3 583 people submitted a questionnaire online and 94 people submitted paper responses, providing a total of 677 responses.
- 1.4 The following constitutes a summary of the content of those responses received. More detailed breakdown and analysis of the data has been conducted within the research department of the Connexional Team and is available for consultation for the purposes of expanding and making use of this material.

2. Limitations

- 2.1 Features of the data collection process limit the scope of this material and the analysis possible. The summary below must not, therefore, be regarded as definitive. To note particularly:
 - ∞ No demographic information or means of identification was collected from respondents.
 - ∞ Lacking the above, checks for repeated entrants has been impossible, although study of the data has revealed the likelihood of this in a number of cases.
 - ∞ Analysis has revealed that some responses were on behalf of groups and some from individuals. However, lacking information on respondents, analysis of the proportions involved is impossible.
 - ∞ The format of questions asked was so broad as to have been interpreted in a variety of ways. This resulted in numerous repeated answers, confusion about what was being asked, and the giving of data in response to the wrong questions. As a result, much potentially-useful data has had to be ignored in this analysis. Quantitative results are therefore tentative and have been formulated from answers which will have been impacted on by these factors, bringing a question upon reliability.
 - ∞ A number of entries were accepted after the cut-off date for submissions, although which these were has not been recorded. All have therefore been used in this analysis.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

2.2 A major theme which appears both directly and indirectly in the majority of responses is a lack of clarity amongst respondents concerning the status of the proposed resource. Numerous comments result from assumptions that the new resource will replace *Hymns & Psalms* and any other prior authorised collection and either supplant or prohibit the use of those prior resources. In a significant majority of survey responses, this assumption colours recommendations and criticisms based on the proposed list of hymns to be included in the new resource.

3. Results

Q1. 66% of total respondents answered this question.

Of these, 68% responded positively; 23% negatively; 14% expressed no opinion.

Major themes:

- ∞ Too many modern works/needs more traditional hymns (9% of responses)
- ∞ Too many traditional hymns/needs more modern works (6%)
- ∞ More Wesley hymns needed (3%)

Q2. 41% of total respondents answered this question.

Of these, 74% felt some names were missing or underrepresented.

Most requested names:

- ∞ Wesley (5% of responses)
- ∞ S. Townsend (5%)
- ∞ P. Field (4%)
- ∞ T. Dudley-Smith (4%)

Q3. 28% of total respondents answered this question.

Of these, 59% felt additional themes/subjects needed representation, or further representation.

Most requested:

- ∞ Children/Under 16 (17% of responses)
- ∞ Weddings/Marriage (4%)
- ∞ Christmas (3%)

Q4. Issues which were addressed most frequently in responses include (in order of frequency):

4.1 Uncertainty of Status

“Many old hymns we sing will disappear!”

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Respondents were unclear as to whether the proposed resource represented a replacement of or supplement to *Hymns & Psalms*, and what the implications of this would be.

This uncertainty led to assumptions that *Hymns & Psalms* would be removed from use and therefore that those works included in the new resource would be the only ones available to churchgoers. Dominant complaints as a result of this included a projected shortage of Wesley hymns and traditional favourites, particularly Christmas carols.

4.2 Resistance to the Concept

“There is a fundamental question with this project which must be asked – Does this project meet the priorities of the Methodist Church and how?”

Repeated responses highlighted that an additional resource is unnecessary. In particular, the cost of producing and buying the resource was noted, as was the environmental impact, and a repeated call was made from online respondents to the survey for a digital resource rather than a paper one.

4.3 Format and Layout

A large variety of responses made requests for considerations about printed and presentation formats. Further consultation is desired in this area.

4.4 Support for the Project

“God bless you in this – we are a singing people!”

Many respondents expressed considerable enthusiasm for a new resource, thanking the group and acknowledging the difficult limitations on them.

APPENDIX D

Revised Table of Contents

A. God's Eternal Goodness

- 1 The Nature and Mystery of God: The Holy Trinity
- 2 Gathering in God's Presence
- 3 The Adoration of God
- 4 Praise and Thanksgiving
- 5 The Glory of God in Creation and Providence

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

- 6 Times and Seasons
- 7 Morning and Evening
- 8 Sunday: The Lord's Day
- 9 Short Songs

B. God's Redeeming Work

- 10 The Word of God in Scripture
- 11 The Promised Christ: Advent
- 12 The Incarnate Christ: Christmas
- 13 The Revealed Christ: Epiphany, Presentation and Baptism
- 14 The Faithful Christ: Lent and Temptation
- 15 The Ministry of Jesus Christ
- 16 Jesus Christ Transfigured
- 17 Jesus Christ the Suffering Servant: The Cross and Passion
- 18 Jesus Christ: Risen and Ascended
- 19 Jesus Christ: Prophet, Priest and King
- 20 Jesus Christ the Saviour: Lord of All
- 21 Short Songs

C. God's Enduring Purpose

- 22 The Gift and Work of the Holy Spirit
- 23 Mission and Evangelism
- 24 Repentance and Forgiveness
- 25 Conversion and New Life
- 26 Our Journey with God
- 27 Growth in Grace and Holiness
- 28 Prayer and Devotion
- 29 Intercession and Petition
- 30 Baptism, Confirmation and Reception into Membership
- 31 Holy Communion and Lovefeasts
- 32 Marriage
- 33 Human Life and Relationships
- 34 Conflict, Suffering and Doubt
- 35 Reconciliation, Healing and Wholeness
- 36 Covenant, Commitment and Dedication
- 37 Calling and Commissioning
- 38 Life and Unity in the Church
- 39 A World of Belief
- 40 Justice and Peace
- 41 The Wholeness of Creation
- 42 Death, Judgement and Eternal Life
- 43 Funerals and Thanksgivings

- 44 The Communion of Saints
- 45 Short Songs

APPENDIX E

Overview of costings for proposed new hymn collection

All these costings are indicative and none can be guaranteed at this stage. Print costs would not be incurred until 2011 and detailed estimates would need to be sought then.

Initial setup costs

These are all the 'one-off' costs associated with preparing the collection for production.

1) Connexional Team

- ∞ liaise with relevant committees and working groups, monitoring timeframes, budgets and progress
 - ∞ identify and investigate print production options and detailed costings
 - ∞ scope and develop options for producing electronic edition/rolling resource
- Costed at one day per week **£8,700** per annum.

2) Music Resources Group

The MRG members have given a huge amount of time voluntarily to the work of selecting a new collection, and their work continues until the selection is complete and the copyright holders have agreed final texts/scores. This voluntary work has not been costed.

- ∞ selection of content
- ∞ structure of contents
- ∞ commissioning musical arrangements where required **£8,000**
- ∞ decision about indices required, and work done on thematic and biblical indices

Meetings and photocopying costs **£13,500** per annum.

3) Compilation and typesetting

Creating a proof version of the collection, correct in content and layout, and negotiating with copyright holders about the inclusion of their texts, edited as required by MRG, the Faith and Order Committee and the Conference. This work would be outsourced to a specialist agency. Depending on size and complexity of the collection, cost between **£25,000 - £40,000**.

4) Copyright

There are two areas of cost: fees payable for reproducing a work and the initiation and administration of a royalties payment system (discussed later).

Copyright owners have exclusive rights to give or withhold permission to reproduce their works during their lifetime and their estate holds these rights for 70 years after their death.

Assumptions

- ∞ For a complete authorised collection, 800 hymns will be selected
- ∞ 75-80% of these will be within copyright
- ∞ Royalty fees will be a maximum of 12.5% of the cover price of the book (regardless of the actual price of each sale, eg. complimentary copies or discounts)
- ∞ Electronic edition would include words only
- ∞ Printed works will retail for the following prices and numbers of first print run:
- ∞ Full music edition **£27.00** (10,000)
- ∞ Words edition **£12.00** (50,000)
- ∞ Large print edition **£20.00** (10,000)

Copyright fees estimated at **£100,150**

Copyright on electronic materials

There are considerable difficulties in securing the right to reproduce copyrighted material in an electronic format, particularly if the intention is to reproduce the music and/or include midi files. Due to (justified) fears of illegal copying and distribution, many artists are reluctant to allow electronic publication of their works.

This fear can mean that artists who do give permission ask for higher copyright fees for electronic publication, but no estimate of this increased cost has been included here. Since copyright holders are in control, it means that an electronic selection could differ from a printed edition.

An electronic edition (a words only CD) would retail at the same price as the printed words edition, **£12.00**.

5) Production costs and options

Printing

- ∞ 50,000 words, 870 pp, hard cover, 17cm x 11.9 cm. £77,500 for initial run and £1,400 per thousand run on.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

- ∞ 10,000 full music, 1500pp, hard cover, 21.2cm x 14.6cm. £32,000 and £2,700 per thousand run on.
- ∞ 10,000 large print, 700pp, hard cover, 23cm x 15.4cm. £17,000 and £1,500 per thousand run on.

Electronic version – CD production costs

5,000 Printed disks in wrapped cellophane cases £2,500

Warehousing costs

£7.25 per pallet (800 books) per month.

If 10% of churches pre-order, warehousing costs on assumed print run would be **£500** per month.

Distribution costs

Current rate is £16 per hour.

70,000 books packed, assuming 20 books per order and 2 packs fulfilled per hour – results in distribution cost of **£28,000** in year one.

6) Sales

Projected sales

In early 2008 a piece of market research was undertaken to determine the likely uptake of a new collection:

- ∞ 40% of churches would purchase/would be likely to purchase a print version
- ∞ 80% of churches would purchase/would be likely to purchase an electronic version.

Changed economic climate

It should be noted that the economic climate has changed dramatically since this research was undertaken, and churches and Circuits will have increased costs (eg. pensions) as a result. This may affect decisions about purchasing the new collection.

Authorised or recommended

These costings and projections are based on the assumption that there is an authorised baseline collection. If the collection is not authorised but only recommended (this would be the case if the option for a supplement is chosen, as only a complete collection can be authorised as containing the whole range of Methodist doctrine), a key factor in the collection's commercial viability is altered.

Churches would have no particular incentive to purchase a collection which was not authorised, over and above any other hymn collection available on the market. No market research has been undertaken to determine the level of sales in this scenario.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

The Connexional Team is required to confine its activities to those which it can 'uniquely or best' undertake. Arguably it is not appropriate for the Connexional Team to devote its time to producing a hymn collection which is not authorised.

Marketing campaign

Marketing activities may include:

- ∞ launch events at Conference 2011 and other sites in Connexion
- ∞ production and distribution of 6000 sample booklets **£2,400**
- ∞ complimentary copies for some choirs/advocates
- ∞ singalong events
- ∞ advertisements

Marketing budget **£25,000**

Sale price

On the estimated retail price for the different formats:

- ∞ if the entire print run were sold at the full retail price in year one, income would be **£1,070,000**.
- ∞ However assuming 1% of print run is given away free of charge, and 50% of the remainder is sold at 20% discount, income could be **£950,000**.

NB this assumes all the stock can be sold directly by Methodist Publishing. If any is sold through shops, a larger trade discount would apply.

7) Managing the production project

Either the entire project of production could be outsourced to a publisher who would undertake the majority of the steps outlined, or a Connexional Team member would manage the project internally.

Internal project management

- ∞ Liaise with typesetter and printer
- ∞ Negotiating with copyright holders
- ∞ Develop marketing campaign
- ∞ Develop copyright payment monitoring (software estimated at **£5000**)
- ∞ Develop delivery system for electronic resource.

Staff cost estimated at **£43,500** per annum.

All sales income would return to the Methodist Church if the work is done internally.

Outsourced project management

In this scenario the publisher undertakes most of the above functions, and the Methodist Church receives a royalty, likely to be 15% on actual sale price (ie. reduced from cover

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

price if copies are discounted or given away). Using the same assumptions about giveaways (1%) and discounts (50% at 20% discount), the total royalty income if the whole print run is sold would be **£136,000**.

There would still be costs borne by the Methodist Church:

- ∞ copyright fees (**£100,150**)
- ∞ marketing (**£25,000**)
- ∞ internal staff liaison for external project manager (**£8,700**)
- ∞ selection of content – MRG meetings and musical arrangement fees (**£35,000**)

8) Alternative – supplement to *Hymns & Psalms*

Conference memorials have raised the question of creating a supplement instead of a baseline collection, and the following indicative costing is supplied, on the assumption that 400 items are included.

- ∞ Words only **£6.50**
- ∞ Large print **£15.00**
- ∞ Music **£18.50**.

Cost	Full Collection	Supplement
Typesetting	£25,000 – £40,000	Estimated 15% reduction in cost £21,250 – £34,000
Copyright	£100,150	£61,975
Printing	£126,266	£76,588

The income from this option (best case of £660,000) would also be lower than that provided in this Report for a full collection (best case of £1,070,000).

9) Implications for churches.

Example costings:

Scenario One:

A traditional church, without projection facilities, with a normal congregation of under 30 people, occasionally attracting 60-70 at special times. A fair proportion of the older people who need large print versions. An organist but no choir or worship band.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Numbers required	Supplement	Supplement Discounted Price ¹	Full Collection	Full Collection Discounted Price
2 x Full Music edition	£37.00	£29.60	£54.00	£43.20
50 x Words edition	£325.00	£260.00	£600.00	£480.00
15 x Large print	£225.00	£180.00	£300.00	£240.00
Total	£587.00	£469.60	£954.00	£763.20

Scenario Two:

A church of 100 which is used to projecting words on the screen. They have a worship band and an organist. They are attended by a mixed age range of whom some older people find it hard to read text from a distant screen.

Numbers required	Supplement	Supplement Discounted Price	Full Collection	Full Collection Discounted Price
6 x Full Music edition	£111.00	£88.80	£162.00	£129.60
1 x Electronic edition	£6.50	£5.20	£12.00	£9.60
10 x Large print	£225.00	£180.00	£200.00	£160.00
Total	£342.50	£274.00	£374.00	£299.20

10) Competition that could affect sales

We know of two significant hymnodies that will be published in 2010. One is a complete new edition of a very popular collection, and one has the character of a supplement. If Methodist churches are inclined to purchase either of these, a new collection in 2011 would be unlikely to be purchased in addition.

APPENDIX F

2009	Contents	Production
April – June	4 meetings of MRG to revise selection and contents order in light of survey and F&O comments	Copyright holders informed of being in draft selection

¹ It is desirable to encourage pre-ordering. Pre-ordering allows the maximising of the initial print run and reduces the risk of that run being too large. For that reason it is common to offer a discount to those who choose to order and pay for their product prior to the initial print run. The discounted price columns represent the cost if a 20% discount for pre-ordering is applied.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Conference (July)	Decision	
16 July	Joint meeting MRG/ CT	Production project meetings to be set up.
August	Faith and Order members sent draft selection	50 copies of text created
September	Dedicated 24 hour meeting of full F&O to scrutinise selection	
Autumn	MRG regular meetings to consider F&O response Musical arrangements commissioned where necessary	Begin negotiations with possible publisher
Late November	Hymn collection an item in F&O agenda	Negotiations with copyright holders
2010	Contents	Production
January-February	MRG/F&O liaison MRG edit in light of copyright holder issues.	Negotiations with copyright holders
March	F&O sign off list for authorisation or recommendation for Conference	Decision about inhouse production or outsourcing
April	Report to Conference finalised	Draft list and sources published online and in print
Conference (End June)	Decision	
July-September	Conference reference group finalises selection in light of Conference debate	Final copyright negotiations
October	Contents final	Production and marketing schedule planned to launch at Conference 2011

APPENDIX G

Members of the Music Resources Group

The Revd Barbara Bircumshaw (Chair) – Superintendent Minister of the Hinckley Circuit, with interest in music and worship.

The Revd John Alderdice – Representative of the Methodist Church in Ireland. Musician with a deep interest in contemporary worship and liturgy.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Mr Damian Boddy – jobbing musician, teacher of singing, trainer in music and worship. Assisted in editing music for hymn collections.

The Revd Alan Bolton – representative of the Faith & Order Committee, Superintendent Minister of the Hyde and Denton Circuit.

Dr Martin Clarke – Associate Lecturer in music with the Open University and part-time tutor in music at Durham University. Formerly Music Coordinator at Cranmer Hall and the Wesley Study Centre, Durham. Organist, pianist and choir director.

Mrs Marjorie Dobson – Methodist Local Preacher. Writer of hymns and other worship material. Three collections published - two jointly authored. Widely anthologised. Member of Hymn Society Executive and of editorial team of Worship Live.

Miss Ruth Horton – Undertaking Foundation Training at Wesley House Cambridge (candidating for presbyteral ministry 2009). Recently undertaken postgraduate research into the subject of congregational singing in worship, with a particular focus on Fresh Expressions.

The Revd Ian Howarth – Assistant Chair, South East District, Connexional Music Advisor, past Precentor of the Methodist Conference, musician, co-author of Leading Music in Worship.

The Revd Kavula John – Circuit Minister, approach to music is intuitive beginning with communicating the Gospel in an African context. She has taken a keen interest in the development of worship styles in cross-cultural experience. She plays the guitar and teaches songs to others.

Miss Emma Parker – representative of the Youth Conference, regular contributor to worship music in the Basingstoke Circuit.

The Revd Phillip Poyner – Minister in South Wales with a strong interest in music in worship, with a commitment to the variety of music in differing worship styles.

The Revd Dr Andrew Pratt – Methodist Minister and tutor at Hartley Victoria College, teaching both liturgy and Methodist identity. He has written over 500 hymns, has three published collections, has edited hymn books and done research in hymnody. Andrew edits the Hymn Society Bulletin, is Deputy Chair of the Pratt Green Trust and a Director of Stainer & Bell Ltd.

The Revd Prebendary Norman Wallwork – Minister in the Gloucestershire Circuit and representative of the Faith & Order Committee. Associate Tutor in Liturgy and Worship at Wesley College Bristol and Methodist Representative on the Joint Liturgical Group.

35. Singing the Faith – The Music Resources Group Report

Mr David Wigley – representative of the Youth Conference, regular contributor to worship music in the Cardiff Circuit.

The Revd Paul Wood – Minister at Coventry Central Hall. Degree in music and education. Organist, and vocally trained. Former Music Director for Durham Musical Theatre Company.

The Revd Ian Worsfold – Minister in Coventry and Nuneaton Circuit. Musician with MA in Music and Liturgy. Passionate about music in worship.